

please follow for
ordering and style
of prelims

Local Officials and the Struggle to Transform Cities

Local Officials and the Struggle to Transform Cities

A view from post-apartheid South Africa

Lower case
for subtitle

Edited by Claire Bénit-Gbaffou

 **UCL**PRESS

First published in 2024 by
UCL Press
University College London
Gower Street
London WC1E 6BT

UCL Press
compiles this page

Available to download free: www.uclpress.co.uk

Collection © Editors, 2024
Text © Contributors, 2024
Images © Contributors, 2024

The authors have asserted their rights under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as the authors of this work.

A CIP catalogue record for this book is available from The British Library.



Any third-party material in this book is not covered by the book's Creative Commons licence. Details of the copyright ownership and permitted use of third-party material is given in the image (or extract) credit lines. If you would like to reuse any third-party material not covered by the book's Creative Commons licence, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright owner.

This book is published under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non-Commercial 4.0 International licence (CC BY-NC 4.0), <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>. This licence allows you to share and adapt the work for non-commercial use providing attribution is made to the author and publisher (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work) and any changes are indicated. Attribution should include the following information:

Bénit-Gbaffou, C. (ed.) 2024. *Local Officials and the Struggle to Transform Cities: A view from post-apartheid South Africa*. London: UCL Press.
<https://doi.org/10.14324/111.9781800085466>

Further details about Creative Commons licences are available at
<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/>

ISBN: 978-1-80008-548-0 (Hbk.)
ISBN: 978-1-80008-547-3 (Pbk.)
ISBN: 978-1-80008-546-6 (PDF)
ISBN: 978-1-80008-549-7 (epub)
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.14324/111.9781800085466>

Contents

Italics for front matter and back matter elements

List of figures
List of tables
List of contributors
List of abbreviations

vii
viii
ix
xiii
1
Do not include page numbers in manuscript

1 Introduction: seeing like a City
Claire Bénit-Gbaffou

Roman numerals for Part numbers

Part I: Seeing the local state through City officials’ practices

2 ‘Welcome to Alcatraz’: a reflection on three years in a City bureaucracy 27
Philip Harrison
3 Activists in the State: City officials working behind the scenes for change in post-apartheid Johannesburg 49
Claire Bénit-Gbaffou

Note caps style for chapter titles

4 Bureaucratic activism for inclusionary development in the City of Johannesburg 81
Margot Rubin
Entering the state as a community activist: the Operation Khanyisa Movement in Johannesburg City Council 105
Nicolette Pingo and Claire Bénit-Gbaffou

remove links to manuscript headings

Part II: Seeing the local state from its margins

6 Acting like the state? Leaders’ participation in street trade management in Gauteng municipalities 135
Mamokete Modiba
7 Crafting a xenophobic bureaucratic order after the May 2008 pogroms in Cape Town 161
Rodolphe Demeestère

Chapters, figures and tables listed by number only, no need for the words ‘Chapter’, ‘Figure’ and ‘Table’

8	The politics of formulating policy on housing evictions in post-apartheid Johannesburg <i>Neil Klug</i>	197
---	--	-----

Part III: Seeing the local state through its policy instruments

9	Identifying learners in Johannesburg's schools: how state rationalities converge to construct institutional xenophobia <i>Jeanne Bouyat</i>	233
10	Seeing and unseeing: housing, poverty and privilege on Johannesburg's Corridors of Freedom <i>Sarah Charlton</i>	265
11	Deceptive lenses: officials' and activists' visions of water issues in eThekweni <i>Mary Galvin</i>	291
12	Lost in translation: the elusive equity objective in Johannesburg's water policy <i>Darlington Mushongera</i>	325
13	'Doing things right' or 'doing the right thing'? Limits to evaluative thinking in Johannesburg <i>Laila Smith</i>	361

Part IV: International perspectives on the art of progressive city government

14	Is there a 'left art' of city government? A view from post-apartheid South Africa <i>Claire Bénit-Gbaffou</i>	387
15	Preserving the progressive City: a North American perspective <i>Pierre Clavel</i>	419
16	Porous bureaucracies, land and urban inclusion: a perspective from Indian cities <i>Varun Patil and Solomon Benjamin</i>	429
17	Blurred boundaries and institutional activism: reflections from Brazil <i>Rebecca Neaera Abers</i>	455
	<i>Index</i>	471

List of figures

No figure source
lines here - these
are only in the
image captions

3.1	Matt's area of intervention: Norwood and the Corridor of Freedom project in Johannesburg	59
5.1	Location of Thembelihle informal settlement	113
6.1	Location of the case study areas in the Gauteng-City region	140
7.1	Eviction letter from the Zanokhanyo Retailers Association in Khayelitsha, 22 August 2008	169
7.2	Letter signed by a representative of the Khayelitsha Somali Retailers Association (KSRA), 28 October 2008	174
7.3	Khayelitsha General Agreement, signed under the supervision of the South African Police Services, 27 November 2008	175
7.4	The Look-Out Hill communiqué, 28 March 2012	183
8.1	Timeline for the formulation of the housing eviction policy	208
10.1	'Notice to vacate' issued to Diane	266
10.2	Small subdivided living space, Louis Botha Avenue	271
10.3	Extract from <i>Corridors of Freedom: Re-stitching our City to Create a New Future</i>	274
10.4	Typical retail and residential building along Louis Botha Avenue	277
11.1	Governing the City? eThekweni Municipality and Ingonyama Trust land	294
11.2	Expected versus actual alignment of interests and positions of water stakeholders	317
12.1	Main actants and the respective intermediaries	327
12.2	Environment and Infrastructure Services Department (EISD) – organogram	329
13.1	City of Johannesburg Group Heads administrative structure	373
13.2	City of Johannesburg line functions reporting to the City manager and relevant political portfolios	378
16.1	The squatter settlement at Uru on Gowmala land	435
16.2	The title deed of a squatter in Uru	437
16.3	Regularising informal settlements through a variety of land statuses – Uru and its surroundings	438
16.4	'Electrified tenures' shape urban landscapes	448

List of tables

5.1	Local Government Group: the Operation Khaniysa Movement leadership structure	116
9.1	Three State rationalities underpinning identification at school	243
11.1	Water consumption and payment in eThekweni, 2010	299
11.2	Interest, image and ideology: factors behind the deceptive lenses, for officials and activists	309
12.1	Water service standards in the City of Johannesburg 2015 Integrated Development Plan	340
12.2	City scorecard on specific Integrated Development Plan (IDP) programmes related to water	341
12.3	Oversight bodies for water in the City of Johannesburg	344
12.4	Compared Key Performance Areas for various senior City officials in charge of water (2017–18)	348
12.5	Elements of water service regulation in the City of Johannesburg	352
12.6	Assessing progress in water delivery to Johannesburg's informal settlements	354
16.1	The various state institutions mobilised by residents to produce the Uru settlement over the years (Bangalore)	440
16.2	Varied electrical loads as land tenures schemes for 'unplanned' activities in Delhi	446

List of contributors

Note bold for contributors and alphabetical order

Neaera Abers, PhD in Urban Planning, is Professor at the Institute of Political Science of the University of Brasília, Brazil. Her research has focused on the politics of institutional change, participatory decision-making, the relations between social movements and the state, and activism inside the policy process. She is the author or editor of four books, including *Inventing Local Democracy: Grassroots politics in Brazil* (Lynne Rienner 2000), and, with Margaret E. Keck, *Practical Authority: Agency and institutional change in Brazilian water Politics* (Oxford 2013). Her recent research explores social movement responses to the pandemic in Brazil.

Claire Bénit-Gbaffou, PhD in Urban Geography and former fellow of Ecole Normale Supérieure (Ulm), is an Associate Professor, Planning in the Department of Geography, Planning, Environment and Development, Aix Marseille University. She is a researcher at MESOPOLHIS (Aix-en-Provence), and Visiting Scholar in the School of Architecture and Planning, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg (where she was previously an Associate Professor). Her research focuses on urban governance and spatial justice in large cities, with a particular interest in the governance of public spaces in urban contexts marked by strong inequalities.

Solomon Benjamin is Professor at the Humanities and Social Science Department of the Indian Institute of Technology Madras, India. An urbanist, he explores the situated histories of land tenure as a basis to think about settlement processes. His current interest is the social practices connected to smartphone refurbishing, where small traders connect ‘China Bazaars’ in Indian cities to Shenzhen. Benjamin is part of the International Critical Geography Association and has been on the editorial board of *Antipode*. He has engaged in critical art practice with various groups.

Jeanne Bouyat, PhD in Political Science (IEP Paris), is a post-doctoral fellow at the University of Johannesburg, Centre for Education Rights and Transformation and previously at University of Oxford, Department of Politics and International Relations. She is a fellow at the Institut Convergences Migrations (CNRS) and at Sciences Po (Paris), Centre for International Studies. Her research looks at xenophobia, nationhood and citizenship in South African schools, with a focus on public administration, political attitudes, pedagogy and activism.

Sarah Charlton, PhD in Planning (University of Sheffield), is Associate Professor in CUBES in the School of Architecture and Planning at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg and a Research Associate of the Southern Centre for Inequality Studies. After a period working in local government and in the non-profit sector she moved into teaching and research, where her current work focuses on housing policy and practice, state interventions in development, and people's lived experiences of cities. She serves on the boards of the journals *African Studies*, *International Development Planning Review*, and the *International Journal on Homelessness*.

Pierre Clavel is Professor Emeritus in the Department of City and Regional Planning, Cornell University. He worked in the field at Blair and Stein Associates doing plans in Cranston, RI, Cape Cod, MA and Binghamton, NY, then did a PhD at Cornell. He taught at the University of Puerto Rico in 1965–67; then at Cornell in 1967–2010. At Cornell, he was director of the Progressive Planning Summer Program (1978–83) and department chair (2001–04). He wrote *The Progressive City* in 1986 and several other books: *Opposition Planning in Wales and Appalachia* (1983); *Harold Washington and the Neighborhoods* (1991 with Wim Wiewel); *Reinventing Cities: Equity planners tell their stories* (1994 with Norman Krumholz); and *Activists in City Hall* (2010).

Rodolphe Demeestère is a doctoral candidate in Political Science, University of Paris I Panthéon-Sorbonne (Centre Européen de Sociologie et de Science Politique – CESSP) and a Teaching Assistant, University of Lille (Centre d'Études et de Recherches Administratives, Politiques et Sociales – CERAPS). His research focuses on the government of urban margins, through the regulation of small trading activities led by diasporic groups in South African cities. Focusing on processes of political contention, social exclusion and economic dispossession, his work analyses the dynamics of institutionalisation of xenophobia in contemporary South Africa.

Mary Galvin, PhD in Political Science (University of California Berkely), is an Associate Professor, Department of Anthropology and Development Studies, University of Johannesburg. She has worked in South Africa's water and sanitation sector since 1994 as a development practitioner, social justice activist and researcher. Her work focuses on local hydropolitics, its impact on universal access to water, and scope for systemic change.

Philip Harrison, PhD in Planning, is the South African Research Chair in Spatial Analysis and City Planning in the School of Architecture and Planning, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. He was Executive Director in Development Planning and Urban Management at the City of Johannesburg from 2006–10. Prior to that, he held academic positions at the Universities of the Witwatersrand and Natal. He also served as a member of the National Planning Commission from 2010–15, participating in the formulation of the National Development Plan. His current work focuses on urban governance, spatial transformation, and large-scale project investment in African cities.

Neil Klug, PhD in Planning, is a Senior Lecturer and Planner, School of Architecture and Planning, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. He has also run an urban planning consultancy since 1999. As a practitioner he has covered a wide range of projects from plan preparations, policy formulation and evaluations, project implementation and training mainly related to low-income housing. His current research focuses are on urban governance, specifically around low-income housing policy and implementation.

Mamokete Modiba, PhD in Planning, is a Senior Researcher, Gauteng City Region Observatory, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. Her PhD investigated the role and influence of street trader leaders in urban governance in three South African metropolitan cities with reflections from Ahmedabad, India. With a background in urban planning, her research spans across a variety of areas including inclusive economies, informal and township economies, urban governance, poverty, inequality and social mobility and spatial change.

Darlington Mushongera, PhD in Planning, is a Senior Researcher, Gauteng City Region Observatory (GCRO). With a background in economics and urban planning, Darlington's research interests span across a number of areas including poverty and inequality, governance, policy

planning, and methods of measuring development. His PhD thesis titled 'Who Governs Johannesburg Water? An actor-network reading of water services governance in the City of Johannesburg (2000–18)' explores the mazes of bureaucracy with respect to water service delivery in the City.

Varun Patil is a Sociologist having completed his master's and MPhil in Sociology at the University of Delhi, currently engaged as a PhD researcher at Max Weber Kolleg, University of Erfurt, Germany. He has worked on several research projects looking at the impact of urban renewal schemes and urban governance reforms both at the local community and state level in Bangalore, Jalandhar-Punjab, and Mumbai. As a filmmaker, he is also involved in visual documentation of city transformations in contemporary India.

Nicolette Pingo is a Programme Manager: Inclusive Cities, at the South African Cities Network, South Africa. She was formerly a Development Facilitation Manager at Johannesburg Development Agency, City of Johannesburg, and is a former Master's student at the University of Witwatersrand, School of Architecture and Planning. Her work focuses on participatory approaches to spatial justice for more equitable Cities.

Margot Rubin, PhD in Planning, is a Lecturer in Spatial Planning, School of Geography and Planning, University of Cardiff and is a visiting lecturer at the School of Architecture and Planning, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, where she was formerly an Associate Professor, South African Research Chair in Spatial Analysis and City Planning. She is also a Research Associate in the Gauteng City-Region Observatory. Currently, she is engaged in research on urban governance in African cities, issues of housing and elite engagement with space in the Global South.

Laila Smith, PhD in Urban Geography, is a Senior Policy Analyst, Climate Change, Policy and Partnerships in the Strategic Policy Branch, Ministry of Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada. She is the former Director of CLEAR-AA, Centre for Learning on Evaluation and Results, Anglophone Africa, School of Governance, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa. Laila worked previously as a Johannesburg City official, when she was appointed the Director of Evaluation and Research for the Contract Management Unit within the City Manager's Office of the City of Johannesburg: the unit monitoring the relationship between the City of Johannesburg and its utility entities (such as Johannesburg Water, City Power, etc).

List of abbreviations

ACC	African Centre for Cities
AEC	Anti-Eviction Campaign
AFD	Agence Française de Développement
ANC	African National Congress
ANT	Actor-Network Theory
APF	Anti-Privatisation Forum
ARP	Alexandra Renewal Project
AVCC	Alexandra Vukuzenzele Crisis Committee
BDA	Bangalore Development Authority
BEC	Branch Executive Committee
BPP	Better Buildings programme
BRT	Bus Rapid Transit
CALS	Centre for Applied Legal Studies
CAPEX	Capital Expenditure
CCF	Concerned Citizen's Forum
CCL	Centre for Child Law
CCS	Centre for Civil Society
CDC	Community Development Corporation
CJP	Central Johannesburg Partnership
CLEAR-AA	Centre for Learning on Evaluation and Results for Anglophone Africa
CMU	Contracts Management Unit
COGTA	Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs
COHRE	Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions
CoJ	City of Johannesburg
CSU	Corporate Strategy Unit
CUBES	Centre for Urbanism and the Built Environment Studies
DA	Delhi Administration
DA	Democratic Alliance
DBE	Department of Basic Education

DED	Department of Economic Development
DESU	Delhi Electrical Supply Undertaking
DFU	Development Facilitation Unit
DHA	Department of Home Affairs
DLF	Democratic Left Front
DPME	Department of Monitoring and Evaluation
DPSA	Department of Public Service and Administration
DPUM	Development Planning and Urban Management
DSBD	Department of Small Business Development
DSS	Dalit Sangharsh Samiti
DTI	Department of Trade and Industry
DWS	Department of Water and Sanitation, then Water Affairs
ECDOE	Eastern Cape Department of Education
ED	Executive Director
EFF	Economic Freedom Fighters
EHP	Emergency Housing Programme
EISD	Environment, Infrastructure and Service Delivery Department
EMG	Environmental Monitoring Group
EMS	Emergency Management Services
EMT	Executive Management Committee
EWS	eThekweni Water Services
FBW	Free Basic Water
GBF	Gugulethu Business Forum
GCR	Gauteng City-Region
GCRO	Gauteng City-Region Observatory
GEAR	Growth, Employment and Redistribution
GEMTRAP	Germiston Traders Partnership
GDE	Gauteng Department of Education
GDS	Growth and Development Strategy
GJMC	Greater Johannesburg Metropolitan Council
GSPCR	Group Strategy, Policy Coordination and Relations
GWM&E	Government-wide Monitoring and Evaluation
HoDs	Heads of Department
ICHIP	Inner City Housing Implementation Plan
ICPS	Inner City Property Scheme
ID	Identification Document
IDP	Integrated Development Plan
IEC	Independent Electoral Commission
IFP	Inkatha Freedom Party

IHB	Inclusionary Housing Bill
ISD	Infrastructure and Services Department
JCPZ	Johannesburg City Parks and Zoo
JDA	Johannesburg Development Agency
JMPD	Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department
JOC	Joint Operation Committee
JOSHO	Johannesburg Social Housing Committee
JPC	Johannesburg Property Company
JRA	Johannesburg Roads Agency
JSIP	Johannesburg Strategic Infrastructure Platform
JW	Johannesburg Water
KIADB	Karnataka Industrial Areas Development Board
KPA	Key Performance Area
KPIs	Key Performance Indicators
KSRA	Khayelitsha Somali Retailers Association
KZDOE	KwaZulu Natal Department of Education
LED	Local Economic Development
LG	Local Government
LHR	Lawyers for Human Rights
MCD	Municipal Corporation of Delhi
MD	Managing Director
MES	Metropolitan Evangelical Services
MFMA	Municipal Financial Management Act
MLA	Member of Legislative Assembly
MMC	Member of the Mayoral Committee
MoE	Municipally Owned Entities
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MTC	Metropolitan Trading company
NAF	Neighbourhood as Factory
NAFCOC	National African Federated Chamber of Commerce and Industry
NIBDS	National Informal Business Development Strategy
NORA	Norwood Residents Association
NPM	New Public Management
NUSP	National Upgrading Support Programme
OKM	Operation Khaniysa Movement
PFMA	Public Finance Management Act
PPPs	Public-Private Partnerships
PR	Proportional Representative
PSUG	Practices of the State in Urban Governance
PT	Partidos dos Trabalhadores

RD	Regional Director
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SAPOA	South African Property Owners Association
SAPS	South African Police Service
SASAMS	South African School Administration and Management System
SAWC	South African Water Caucus
SDA	Service Delivery Agreement
SDBIP	Service Delivery Budget Implementation Plan
SDF	Spatial Development Framework
SDS	Students for a Democratic Society
SEEC	Soweto Electricity Crisis Committee
SERI	Socio-Economic Rights Institute
SHRA	Social Housing Regulatory Agency
SLO	Stakeholders Liaison Officer
SMME	Small, Medium and Micro Enterprise
SPLUMA	Spatial Planning Land Use Management Act
SPRE	Special Process for the Relocation of Evictees
TCC	Thembelihle Crisis Committee
TEA	Temporary Emergency Accommodation
TEAP	Temporary Emergency Accommodation Provision Policy
TITRC	Tshwane Informal Trading Committee
TOD	Transit-Oriented Development
TNPD	Tshwane Metro Police Department
TRA	Transitional Residential Accommodation
UDF	Urban Development Framework
UNHCR	United Nations High-Commissioner for Refugees
VN	Viswas Nagar
WFRA	Westcliff Flats Residents' Association
WR&B	Water Resources and Biodiversity
WSR&PD	Water Services Regulation and Policy Development
ZEIS	Zones of Special Public Interest
ZRA	Zanokhanyo Retailers Association